



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

utterly inadequate the critical theory of their post-exilic origin, and finds in the existing grouping of them a natural order and sequence, following a psychological law of evolution. Hence he considers this order the true one, and all attempts to fix upon another as futile and unjustifiable. Consequently, the Davidic origin of those Psalms which appear under David's name is an established fact with him.

In order to trace the development of Israel's religion, then, all that is needed is to expound the contents of the books of the Bible in a sort of running commentary or paraphrase, taking them in the following order: the Psalms, the wisdom literature, the prophets, the law, the historical books.

The question may now be asked: How does the author justify his unique conclusions? The answer cannot be very clear, for the author is not a clear writer. His main dependence in the argument, however, is the naturalness of the process of development he assumes. But this is one of the arguments of the critics, and with them it is only one of several; while with Bestmann it is the only one used. The difference of method, therefore, between him and them is not so much one of the kind of considerations taken into account, as of the validity of some and the comparative value of one over the others. He rejects as irrelevant considerations which they accept as primary. He accepts as conclusive considerations which they regard as partial and inadequate.

We shall not undertake to pass judgment in this dispute between Bestmann and the critics. While we cannot regard his reasoning as entirely convincing, we may commend it as quite plausible. It demonstrates that the same facts may lead to one set of conclusions, viewed from one standpoint, and to another set viewed from a different angle, and, this being the case, it may be safe to infer that more light, and light of a different nature, is needed for the solution of the problems of biblical criticism which will satisfy all the parties at present so far apart from one another.

A. C. ZENOS.

MCCORMICK THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY.

STUDIES IN JUDAISM. By S. SCHECHTER, M.A., Reader in Talmudic in the University of Cambridge. New York: The Macmillan Co. 1896. 8vo, pp. xxv + 366.

THE essays which are collected in this volume were originally published in the *Jewish Quarterly Review* and the *Jewish Chronicle*. They

cover a somewhat wide range of subjects, and differ considerably in interest and value; one or two of them, like those on "The Jewish Boswell" and "The Earliest Jewish Community in Europe," might have been omitted without loss.

The article on "The Hebrew Collection of the British Museum" gives some idea of the wealth of that great library both in printed books and manuscripts. In reprinting it, the author might have noted that, since it was written, a descriptive list of the Hebrew and Samaritan manuscripts, by G. Margoliouth, has been published (1893). In "The Titles of Jewish Books" Mr. Schechter has collected a number of the curious and fanciful titles in which Jewish bibliographies abound, and which often seem to have been chosen expressly that no one might guess, from the name of the book, what it was about. The fondness for such titles is, of course, not distinctively Jewish; other oriental literatures furnish parallels in multitude, and the comparison might not be uninteresting. The essays on "The Child in Jewish Literature" and on "Woman in Temple and Synagogue" deal in an instructive way with these sides of the social life of the Jews.

The chief importance of the volume, however, lies in the essays which have a more distinctly theological character. One of the best of these is the sympathetic study of Rabbi Moses ben Nachman (d. *ca.* 1270). The sketch of Nachmanides' theology is of peculiar interest as showing how in mediæval Jewish thought, as in contemporary Christian theology, by the side of the intellectual systems which were philosophically dependent on Aristotle, like that of Maimonides, there ran another current in which the immanence of God was central. Chassidism, to which another very interesting essay is devoted, shows how spiritual needs, as well as theological reasoning, may bring men to the same truth of the divine immanence. Mr. Schechter describes the rise of Chassidism; the life of its founder, Baalshem; its early teachings; and the swift degeneration which seems to be the fate of mystical sects, its lofty ideas being materialized in the vulgar superstitions of Zaddikism.

The life of Rabbi Elijah Wilna, one of the most strenuous opponents of Chassidism, presents another side of Jewish life and thought in the eighteenth century. The influence of this great scholar in introducing a sounder method in the interpretation of the ancient authorities, and in directing the attention of students, who had occupied themselves almost exclusively with the Babylonian Talmud, to the wealth of material to be found in the Halachic Midrashim, the

Tosephta, and the Jerusalem Talmud, cannot easily be exaggerated. A man of very different type was Nathan Krochmal, who is the subject of the second essay. Krochmal's only published work, the posthumous *Guide of the Perplexed of our Time*, is, as the title indicates, an attempt to do for those involved in the philosophical and critical difficulties of the nineteenth century what Maimonides did for his own age. And like Maimonides—and many another—his attempt to resolve doubts was branded as heresy by those who had no doubts. Mr. Schechter gives a brief synopsis of the contents of this interesting apologetic treatise. But Krochmal's great influence was exerted through his friends and disciples, among whom were some of the most eminent of recent Jewish scholars.

Two of the essays in the volume deal with doctrinal subjects. That on "The Dogmas of Judaism" controverts the common assertion that Judaism is a religion without dogmas; and gives an instructive synopsis of the various attempts to define the essential articles of Jewish faith, from the Mishna to the end of the seventeenth century, with especial attention to the controversies of Maimonists and Antimaimonists. The other, on "The Doctrine of Divine Retribution in Rabbinical Literature," deals chiefly with the discussions of the problem of the sufferings of the righteous. There is no more agreement upon this question among the rabbis than among other men. If one affirms the stern doctrine, "No suffering or death without sin," others as emphatically deny it. It may perhaps be noted as a defect in the treatment of the subject that the compensations of the future life are scarcely touched on, though it is in the introduction of this factor that the rabbinical discussions of the problem most plainly go beyond the standpoint of the Old Testament—take for a single example the saying of R. Eleazar ben Zadok (*Kiddushin* 40 b). On the other hand, the author brings out very clearly the higher teaching of the Talmud, that disinterested goodness is true goodness,—right is not to be done for reward, either here or hereafter.

The essay on "The History of Jewish Tradition" is a review of Weiss's great work on that subject (*Dör dör we-dōreshaw*), which, beginning with the Old Testament itself, comes down to the compilation of the code of R. Joseph Caro. Of especial interest is the excellent translation of Weiss's résumé of rabbinical theology (pp. 197 ff.).

"The Law and Recent Criticism" is a somewhat desultory review of Professor Toy's *Judaism and Christianity*, the chief point of which seems to be that, though Professor Toy is less prejudiced than most

Christian writers, Jewish legalism is judged too unfavorably. It cannot be proved, Mr. Schechter avers, "that legalism or nomism has ever tended to suppress the spiritual side of religion." I think that students of the history of religions would agree that it has been proved a great many times.

As a whole this volume is a valuable contribution to that better understanding of Judaism which cannot fail to result in a juster appreciation. To the same good end the author's articles on "Aspects of Rabbinic Theology" which have appeared in the *Jewish Quarterly Review*, and are shortly to be issued in a volume of the Jewish Library by the same publishers, will also do their part. It should be added that notes at the end of the volume give references to the literature and to the passages cited. Some of these do not appear to have been verified with sufficient care, and there are occasional omissions; for example, on p. 105 an important passage from Nachmanides' *Date of Redemption* is said to be quoted by Azariah de Rossi, but the reader is left to discover for himself that it is at the end of chap. 43 of *Imre Bina*. There is also an index of names, but none of subjects.

ANDOVER THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY.

GEORGE F. MOORE.

THE EPIC OF THE FALL OF MAN: a Comparative Study of Cædmon, Dante and Milton. By S. HUMPHREYS GURTEEN, A.M., LL.D. New York and London: Putnam's Sons. 1896. pp. x + 347.

THIS book is of a type that has become popular of late years; one very easy to produce even with inferior preparation, but of value only when prepared by one who has thoroughly mastered the topic treated. There has been a deluge of lectures on comparative literature, most of which have been of little value, no doubt, but which have not been printed and consequently have done but little harm. Mr. Gurteen's work might well have remained in the obscurity of manuscript, for it is a very shallow and shabby specimen of its class.

The word "shabby" is chosen intentionally, because it seems to be the proper term to apply to a writer that takes up a topic on which many are now seeking information and offers his readers a synopsis of what was said by editors and critics more than half a century ago, much of which has been totally disproved by later investigations or by recent discoveries. If Mr. Gurteen thinks that Conybeare's *Illustrations* (pub-